

FUNDAMENTAL PHYSICS DIRECTORATE

JoAnne Hewett
Associate Lab Director
Chief Research Officer

2575 Sand Hill Road, MS 81
Menlo Park, California 94025
650-926-4424
650-926-2525 – FAX
hewett@slac.stanford.edu

November 28, 2018

Dr. J. Stephen Binkley
Acting Director
Office of Science
U.S. Department of Energy

Dr. Anne L. Kinney
Assistant Director
Mathematical and Physical Sciences
National Science Foundation

Dear Dr. Binkley and Dr. Kinney,

The report of the main HEPAP Subpanel for a portfolio review of DOE Office of High Energy Physics operating experiments was presented to HEPAP at its meeting on May 14, 2018. This subpanel was one of two formed to deliver reports addressing the charge in your letter of October 13, 2017 for HEPAP to assemble subpanels "to conduct an independent peer review of currently operating experiments supported by DOE Office of HEP," with a "focus on scientific impact and productivity of HEP-supported contributions to these experiments within the context of the overall DOE HEP portfolio."

At the HEPAP meeting, the main Subpanel chair Dr. Paul Grannis summarized the major findings of the review. A draft of the written report had been circulated to HEPAP prior to, and in order to prepare for, the HEPAP meeting. The DOE General Counsel identified two categories of conflict of interest for the purpose of discussion and voting on this report: (i) Personal membership in one or more of the 13 collaborations reviewed in the report, and (ii) institutional membership in one of these collaborations. The second conflict of interest pertained to those HEPAP members whose home institutions held collaboration membership, regardless of whether the HEPAP member participated in that collaboration. All but five HEPAP members were thus conflicted for discussion. Of the five non-conflicted HEPAP members, only four were eligible to vote on the report. The five eligible HEPAP members discussed the report at the meeting, and the four eligible members voted to endorse the report without objection. Subsequent to the HEPAP meeting, the subpanel has prepared the final report, which is attached.

The review process was greatly aided by the extensive and detailed information provided in advance by the experimental collaborations under review. The review was expertly performed and documented by the subpanel and I thank the subpanel members on behalf of HEPAP.

With this letter, on behalf of the four eligible voting members of HEPAP, I respectfully submit for your consideration the final report of the HEPAP Main Subpanel for review of DOE U.S. operating experiments. In doing so, I note that the majority of HEPAP members have not discussed or endorsed the report.

Sincerely,

JoAnne L. Hewett

JoAnne L. Hewett

Chair, High Energy Physics Advisory Panel