



U.S. DEPARTMENT OF
ENERGY

Office of
Science

HEP Comparative Grant Reviews

Glen Crawford

Director, Research and Technology R&D

Office of High Energy Physics

Office of Science

October 27, 2011

Housekeeping Items

- **Open Skies**
 - DOE contractors (lab employees) can now travel on non-US flag carriers for research-related travel to EU & Switzerland
- **Early Career Research 2012**
 - Announcement is out, proposals **DUE Nov 29**
 - Pre-applications were required. All PIs have been notified.
 - Expect roughly the same number of awards as last year
 - However there are differences in detail with respect to 2011. See <http://www.science.doe.gov/early-career>
 - PIs may propose to both Early Career and HEP Comparative Review solicitations but must have *different research scope*

HEP Presidential Awardees

Three current HEP Early Career winners also received 2010 Presidential Early Career awards:

- Christian Bauer, LBNL
- Alysia Marino, Colorado
- Evgenya Simakov, LLNL



Update on funding actions

- **Lots of additional grant actions in FY 2009-10:**
 - Early Career + ARRA Infrastructure supplements + incremental funding (“PIFs”)
- **We returned to “normal” workload in FY2011:**
 - Also made conscious decision to reduce number of supplements
 - Average time-to-award improved somewhat

# actions	FY10	FY11
New	72	59
Renewal	90	65
Continuation	119	125
Supplement	160	20
HEP Total	441	269



FY2012 grants status

- **DOE CFO released partial FY2012 funds for grants Oct 14**
 - Based on available funding under CR and planned actions
 - HEP working through a prioritized list of 42 actions
 - Conferences, no fund extensions and renewals have priority
 - More actions will move up in the queue when/if additional Appropriations are provided
 - If urgent cash-flow problems at your institution please let us know



HEP Comparative Reviews

- **Why are we doing this?**
- **How is the process going to work?**
- **What is the impact on my current grant?**
- **Bottom-lines:**
 - **All** HEP grants renewing in FY2012 are affected
 - Intent is to closeout all these grants and institute new ones.
 - Grants responding to the Comparative Review FOA (DE-FOA-0000573) are **DUE Nov 15**
 - This is a hard deadline. Proposals submitted after this date will NOT be accepted.
 - Most common questions are addressed on HEP website:
 - <http://science.energy.gov/~media/hep/pdf/files/pdfs/HEPComparativeReviewFAQ.pdf>



Why Comparative Review?

- **The goal of this effort is to improve the overall quality and efficacy of the HEP research program by identifying the best proposals.**
 - Program Managers feel the need to directly compare groups working in the same area to optimize their programs, particularly in an era of tight research budgets
 - General concerns about fairness of funding distribution across the program.
 - Allows for better alignment of research program with priorities
- **This change in process has been recommended by several DOE advisory committees, most recently the 2010 HEP Committee of Visitors.**



Basic Process

- 1. All FY12 grants renewing before 4/31/12 given short “terminal” renewal (or no-fund extension) at approximately FY11 level**
 - Standard proposal + lightweight review process for this part
 - Funding level will depend on carry-over and local conditions
 - Grants renewing later in year can be handled case-by-case but are encouraged to submit to Comparative Review
- 2. New FOA for grants renewing in FY12 requesting *separate* sub-proposals for 3 frontiers + theory +tech R&D, due Nov 15**
 - The “separate” proposals can still be under a single umbrella
 - Process and strategic guidance on research directions announced in advance to community and copied as appropriate in FOA.
 - PIs can propose to >1 program
- 3. Separate mail/panel reviews for each sub-area. Can get reviewers from 2/3 of community who are not in the hopper for this renewal cycle**
 - Panels scheduled for mid-January, reviewers being lined up now
 - Lower performers phased out
 - Bottom-line fixed per program, based on HEP management guidance
- 4. New awards start 5/1/12 , will likely have <12 month initial period.**
- 5. Repeat annually until 3 year cycle is completed.**
 - Will incorporate lessons learned in future cycles



General Remarks

- **Eligibility**

- Not just for existing DOE HEP groups
 - New grant applications welcome
 - However, proposal must be for scope not funded elsewhere
- Proposals must be for HEP Research or related technology R&D
 - See FOA for details
 - Proposals for conferences, experimental operations, etc., should be submitted to the general Office of Science FOA [DE-FOA-0000600]

- **Proposal**

- There are hard page limits (9 pages per senior investigator)
 - Proposals not respecting the page limits will NOT be reviewed
 - Limit applies for total proposal, not person-by-person
 - See FOA and FAQ site for details

Special Cases

- **Multiple Proposals**

- PIs can submit proposals to more than one solicitation but they have to be for distinct research scope
 - In such cases HEP program managers will make the decision whether two proposals from the same PI are truly distinct
- HEP Early Career proposals will be reviewed and evaluated in parallel with the Comparative Review process

- **Grants renewing late in FY2012 and other New Proposals**

- Are strongly encouraged to submit a new proposal to the new Comparative Review FOA.
 - New or renewal proposals submitted to the general solicitation will be reviewed following standard merit review criteria; *however, funding available to respond to proposals submitted to the general solicitation will be extremely limited*



Comparative Review Timeline

- **All proposals to HEP by December. Identifying reviewers now**
 - Timely turn-around needed on mail reviews (over holidays)
- **Review panels set for Jan 19-27 (1 panel/day).**
- **Current estimated # of proposals (new + renewal):**
 - Theory: 25 proposals
 - Technology R&D (incl. detector R&D): 20
 - Cosmic Frontier :13; Intensity : 12; Energy: 20

Note ~1/3 of proposals are “umbrellas” with multiple pieces
- **HEP PMs will meet in February to assess reviews and decide funding.**
 - Hopefully FY2012 budget will be resolved by then...
- **New awards issued to Chicago procurement by ~end of Feb. for May 1 start date.**

Summary

- **DOE/HEP undertaking Comparative Reviews**
 - New process but trying to match smoothly with existing grants
 - Communicating frequently with community
 - Many details available in FOA and HEP FAQ site
 - We appreciate your cooperation and patience
 - Goal is better-optimized, more efficient program
- **FY2012 grants process starting after some expected delays**
 - Prioritizing actions within boundary conditions
 - Eventually Comparative Review process will move grant start dates away from beginning of FY and avoid some built-in delays

